

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

California Department of Education
721 Capitol Mall, State Board Room 166
Sacramento, California 95814

(Note: The meeting of the English-Language Arts/English Language Development Subject Matter Committee previously scheduled for November 27 was cancelled.)

1. Full Curriculum Commission Meeting, Tuesday, November 28, 2000, 9:00 a.m.

Curriculum Commissioners--Present:

Marilyn Astore, Chair	Patrice Abarca, Vice Chair
Roy Anthony	Catherine Banker
Rakesh Bhandari	Mary Coronado Calvario
Ken Dotson	Lora Griffin
Veronica Norris	Janet Philiposian (<i>present for morning of 11/28</i>)
Richard Schwartz	Leslie Schwarze
Barbara Smith	Karen Yamamoto

Commissioners--Absent:

Viken Hovsepian *
Sue Stickel *
Dede Alpert, Member of the Senate
Jack Scott, Member of the Assembly

State Board of Education Liaisons

Nancy Ichinaga (absent) Marion Joseph (present)

California Department of Education Staff Present to Support Commission:

Sherry Skelly Griffith, Executive Secretary for the Curriculum Commission, and Director,
Curriculum Frameworks and Instructional Resources Division (CFIR)
Thomas Adams, Administrator I, Curriculum Frameworks Unit, CFIR Division
Suzanne Rios, Administrator I, Instructional Resources Unit, CFIR Division
Sandi Adams-Jones, Staff Service Manager I, CFIR Division
Judith Brown, Consultant, CFIR Deborah Keys, Consultant, CFIR
Barbara Jeffus, Consultant, CFIR Olga Uribe, Consultant, CFIR
Teri Ollis, Analyst, CFIR Terri Yan, Exec. Secretary, CFIR

- A. Call to Order. Commissioner Astore, Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:04 a.m. and welcomed the audience and the Commissioners.
- B. Salute to the Flag. The Chair invited Commissioner Dotson to lead the Pledge of Allegiance.
- C. Welcome. Chair Astore welcomed the commissioners and the public. She thanked all for their diligent effort to be in attendance and called attention to the memorable meeting this would be with the action on the mathematics adoption and as the last meeting for

* *Absent for Cause* notification submitted to Commission Chair in advance of the meeting.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

Commissioners Dotson and Smith. She reminded those in attendance of the celebration planned for the departing Commissioners.

- D. Review of Agenda. Chair Astore indicated that some adjustments would be made in the agenda—to accommodate guest presenters as appropriate and to adjust the timing of committee meetings for English-Language Arts and Electronic Learning Resources.
- E. Approval of Minutes for September 2000. Commissioner Griffin moved for the approval of the minutes with the correction of her name in the attendance list for the meetings; Commissioner Banker seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

F. Report of the Chair, including -State Board Action and Other Matters.

Chair Astore reported on the October and November State Board meetings and referenced the letters to the Board within the agenda packet. Actions included the following:

- approval of the extension of the deadline for ELA/ELD IMAP and CRP applications
- approval of the permanent extensions of Commissioner appointment for four-year terms from October 31 to December 31 to create a term of four calendar years
- approval of an opportunity for Board member Marian Bergeson to present her input on the draft Science Framework in January during her last meeting of the SBE
- approval of the CLRN evaluation criteria for standards-aligned supplemental electronic learning resources and
- acceptance of the Commissions' policy to conform to SBE policy on test preparation and what is acceptable in basic instructional materials.

G. Report from the State Board of Education.

Chair Astore invited Greg Geeting, interim Executive Director of the State Board of Education, and Marion Joseph, State Board of Education Member, to speak to the Commission. Ms. Joseph reported how pleased she was that the SBE and CDE staff were able to arrange for shipment of a hard copy of the frameworks to each teacher in California. She expressed thanks for the Commission and CDE staff work on the review criteria adopted by the SBE for the review of electronic learning resources.

Ms. Joseph reported on the many comments she had received about the deliberation processes for the mathematics adoption—both the CRP deliberations and the IMAP deliberations. She indicated that the increased public awareness throughout this adoption process had increased the success of the process. She shared that the State Board commends those who worked so diligently on the adoption process. She asked that the Commissioners keep in mind that this phase of the adoption process is advisory and “. . . to take into account the totality of all you receive about each submission in making your recommendations to the State Board.” The State Board wants a clear recommendation for each submission and understands that the matter of withdrawal is an issue that Mr. Geeting later discussed. Ms. Joseph reported on Board Member Ichinaga's illness with regret that she was not able to attend this important meeting.

Mr. Geeting shared the research of whether SBE could/should allow a publisher to withdraw from the adoption process after the timeline described in Title 5. He asked the Commission to

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

ensure that a clear and specific recommendation to either adopt or reject each submission be provided to the SBE. He reminded that the SBE obligation under law is to hold a public hearing on the Commission's recommendations.

Mr. Geeting indicated that the State Board and retiring member Marion Bergeson were pleased to have the Science Framework scheduled for discussion in January. He said that Board Member Bergeson is proud of the work done by so many on the Science Framework.

Mr. Geeting reported that the document on legal and social compliance is undergoing professional editing and that the CFIR Division staff and Chair Astore will review the document prior to printing.

Mr. Geeting noted that the draft standards for Visual and Performing Arts were part of the Commission agenda. He indicated that the State Board would discuss whether or not the standards enjoy the broad support and endorsement of the education community. It is important to the State Board that standards be for all students, as are the standards in the four core areas. The Board will ensure that the "... VPA standards, while rigorous and reflecting high expectations, are nonetheless seen as reasonable and attainable by all students at every level."

Mr. Geeting requested future consideration about the issues related to moral and civic education, as described in correspondence presented to the Commission. Also, he informally requested consideration of a report from the Commission for schools and districts regarding the math and language arts adoptions. At that time, Ms. Banker proposed the development of a compilation evidences from CRP, IMAP, public hearings and other evidence sources presented after the deliberations and organized within a short report to go to the SBE to clarify the Commission decisions. Ms. Griffith indicated that the draft report the Commission routinely sends to the SBE is the basis of the final SBE adoption report that will reflect guidance for further clarification received from the State Board.

In closure, Mr. Geeting expressed on behalf of President Lazano and the whole Board the appreciation and commendation for Commissioner Ken Dotson and Commissioner Barbara Smith for their term of service. (Ms. Joseph presented a certificate of appreciation to them on the morning of November 29.)

H. Correspondence/Requests from the State Board of Education.

Chair Astore referenced an October 4 request from the SBE that the Commission make recommendations for the revision of the *Handbook on Moral and Civic Education*. This is estimated to be completed by fall of 2001. Chair Astore requested a **motion** that this issue be an item on the January Executive Committee agenda for review and referral to the appropriate SMC for the March meeting; the motion passed unanimously.

The other item of correspondence was dated October 26 from Mr. Geeting to the Board and copied to the Commissioners regarding proposed revisions to the Schiff-Bustamante Waiver Policy.

I. Report of the California Department of Education Executive Office.

* *Absent for Cause* notification submitted to Commission Chair in advance of the meeting.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

Chair Astore welcomed Scott Hill, Chief Deputy Superintendent for Accountability and Administration, California Department of Education, to update the Commission on issues of importance in their work. Mr. Hill expressed to Commissioner Smith and Commissioner Dotson the gratitude from Superintendent Eastin for their diligent work on the Curriculum Commission. He said that each of them have distinguished themselves during this time of tremendous transition in terms of curriculum and instructional materials. He applauded their “. . . vision and understanding to know how to make a difference knowing that the stakes are getting higher and higher.”

Deputy Hill discussed many topics with the Commission during this update. The Superintendent has invited Commissioner Philibosian to participate in the next stage of the California Literature List. His update included information about the Superintendent’s Task Force on Professional Development, efforts related to building bridges with higher education, the high school exit exam, and the redesign of compliance and monitoring processes to ensure a system to gauge the success of schools from the bottom line of student achievement.

J. Executive Secretary Report, Sherry Skelly Griffith, Executive Secretary to the Commission. Executive Secretary Griffith provided news of several new CFIR staff members, Olga Uribe, Rick Alford, and Teri Ollis. She offered congratulations to Joseph Nation, former Commissioner, who was recently elected to the Assembly. She reported that two new Commissioners would be appointed to the body to begin in January.

Executive Secretary Griffith reported to the Commissioners that the SBE staff and CFIR staff were able to work with CDE Press to arrange for distribution of a hard copy of the new Mathematics and Reading/Language Arts frameworks to every teacher in California public schools—500,000 copies of each. She discussed the involvement of American Association of Publishers (AAP) in a survey summarizing the financial requirements for instructional materials, which will be presented to the Commissioners in January. Speaker Hertzberg will carry legislation to make the \$250,000 permanent for Schiff-Bustamante funding.

Ms. Griffith provided a summary of legislation of interest to the Commission, including the following:

- ◆ SB 1354 calls for all 7-12 courses of study in mathematics to include algebra as a high school graduate requirement;
- ◆ SB 1390 calls for the establishment of voluntary Visual and Performing Arts content standards;
- ◆ AB 2236 permits a school district to review materials to determine when obsolete and report result at a public meeting of the district governing board;
- ◆ AB 1785 requires the CDE revise curriculum frameworks and guidelines and the moral and civic education curricula to include human relations education to foster an appreciation for the diversity of California’s population and discourage discriminatory practices. (*see Chair’s report*).

Ms. Griffith also reviewed consultant vacancies experienced by CFIR and elsewhere in the Department. She indicated that the administrators are working of a “work shedding and

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education
Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000
(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

Postponement plan to ensure that the ELA/ELD adoption and critical framework deadlines can be completed first.

K. Schiff-Bustamante Standards-Based Instructional Materials Program (Update).

Ms. Griffith provided an update on the results from the certification reports from districts about their expenditure of funds from the Schiff-Bustamante Standards-Based Instructional Materials Program. She shared data with the Commissioners and the audience a summary of the voluntary information provided by districts about what products are being purchased in each content area. Along with this report, data is also being gathered within the district “header” for the STAR testing information to indicate what materials are being used. This information will be available next spring or summer.

L. Assessment Update – ELD Assessment.

Chair Astore invited Richard Diaz, Administrator with the Assessment Division, to share what has transpired the last few months on the pilot test for English language development (listening, speaking, reading and writing). Dr. Diaz introduced Mark Felter, administrator of the Education Research and Evaluation Unit. They reviewed the developmental process used in conjunction with the contracted test developer, the pilot testing held during the fall of 2000, and the level-setting work forthcoming. Dr. Diaz fielded a variety of questions from the Commissioners.

M. Legal and Social Compliance – Overview of Training.

Executive Secretary Sherry Griffith introduced the presenters from the Curriculum Frameworks and Instructional Resources Division, Nancy Placencia and Miguel Cordova. They provided an abbreviated overview of the multi-media training segment used to prepare reviewers for the recent Legal and Social (LS) Compliance review that took place for the mathematics adoption. The CFIR staff members responded to a variety of questions from the Commissioners. The discussion included the need for the Commission to appoint one member to participate on the appeals panel from the LS review forthcoming along with the Commission chair and the chair of the Mathematics subject matter committee.

N. Library Update, Barbara Jeffus, Consultant, CDE.

Ms. Jeffus provided background information about the new state school library consultant who has joined the California Department of Education, Martha Rowland. Ms. Rowland was providing consultation services elsewhere that day. Ms. Jeffus gave an overview of the library memo (also available at <http://www.cde.ca.gov>) recently sent to schools about this year’s round of library act funding and the California Classroom Act funding. She explained that the third year of funding for school libraries is currently being initiated. She said that the second year of online survey work is underway to establish a longitudinal study of progress for California school libraries. She invited the Commissioners to visit the CDE “DataQuest” feature on the Web site and explore where the credentialed school library staff exists in California schools. Commissioner Bhandari asked about the extent to which alternative textbooks are made available in school libraries to enable teachers to direct students to alternative approaches to learning the standards when needed. Ms. Jeffus offered to make another update in the early spring.

O. Other Matters/Audience Comment

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

No other matters from the Commission or the audience were presented. Chair Astore recessed the full commission at 11:30 a.m. for a brief break and encouraged Commissioners to remain present during the Executive Committee discussion.

2. Executive Committee.

Present: Marilyn Astore, Chair, Patrice Abarca, Vice Chair
Catherine Banker, Ken Dotson

Absent: Sue Stickel *

Staff: Sherry Skelly Griffith, Executive Secretary to Commission, CFIR Div. Dir.
Judith Brown, Consultant, CFIR

A. Procedures for Elections (Information/Action).

Chair Astore called the Executive Committee to order at 11:45 a.m. She introduced the need to determine the timing of the election of Chair, Vice Chair, and the Executive Committee members. The year 2001 is the first year when all SBE appointed Commissioners would serve calendar year terms that commence in January. Nearly all newly appointed Commissioners will come on board in January in the future, rather than the November of the past practice. This is an appropriate time to reconsider the prior practice (not a rule) of when elections are held. Chair Astore shared several options for consideration regarding the timing of the next election for the Commission in light of the new dates for each term year. Abbreviated versions of these options are: (1) hold all leadership decision to January of the next term year; (2) hold a formal election for Commission Chair and Vice Chair during the closure of the November meeting with Executive Committee decisions to be made in January; (3) Hold all elections in November at the end of the meeting with committee appointments to be made in January.

The discussion included a range of comments. Catherine Banker immediately made a motion to wait until January for both elections and appointments in order to allow new members to participate and vote. Commissioner Abarca seconded it. The discussion that followed included Commissioner Dotson's concerns that the second option was more favorable because when he came on board he had no idea of who to vote for and what each nominee could bring to the leadership of the commission. Commissioner Abarca commented that the new commissioners should vote for chair and vice chair and all executive Committee members rather than those who are outgoing. Chair Astore reported that Glen Thomas, former Executive Secretary of the Commission, had indicated his recommendation to maintain prior practice of involving new Commissioners in the elections. The Executive Secretary recommended the motion be restated to make January a permanent change for the election of officers. Commissioner Banker amended the motion to state "The Commission will elect the chair, vice chair, and executive committee members in January at the beginning of each term year." Commissioner Abarca seconded the motion. The voice vote resulted in three "aye" votes (Astore, Abarca, Banker) and one "nay" (Dotson). The motion passed.

B. Follow-Up Adoption Timelines (Discussion/Action)

Three different subject areas (science, history-social science, and VPA) are scheduled for follow-up adoptions in 2002. Judi Brown, CFIR consultant, reviewed a draft timeline of major activities for the follow-up adoptions in 2002. Because the full Commission will be involved in some way with these activities for all three adoptions, the Executive Committee provided input

* *Absent for Cause* notification submitted to Commission Chair in advance of the meeting.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

(additions, deletions, cautions, etc.) on this draft template in preparation for later discussion by each subject matter committee. The discussion that followed raised concern for the need to do a second survey with publishers regarding their interest in the adoptions. The committee directed the staff to return the timeline to the Executive Committee in January with changes requested. The changes will include a July 2002 date for the IMAP deliberations in order to accommodate the Commissioner involved in year-round schools. That adjustment will require action by the Board in November 2002 on the follow-up adoptions.

C. Preliminary Planning for January Training (Discussion).

Chair Astore recalled that one of the Executive Committee goals is to “Develop priorities for Commissioner trainings as needed.” A discussion followed about the preferences for the January 17 orientation to initiate the new term year for the Commission. She recommended a time period of approximately 9-2 on the first day of the annual three-day meeting with plans for elections and Executive Committee actions later in the afternoon. CFIR staff provided a listing of recommended items to be reviewed and discussed. Chair Astore referred to them as equally “competing priorities.” The discussion included recommendations for an outside expert to review skills of facilitating the negotiations and consensus building necessary while using objective ground rules and guidelines. Also of interest was a review of responding to pressures from the public, press, and publishers. Commissioner Dotson recommended a frank discussion about conflicts of interest and rules of ethics.

D. Other Matters/Audience Comments. Commissioner Banker reminded Commissioners submit their contributions to the Commission “Sunshine Fund.” No other discussion occurred and Chair Astore adjourned the committee at 12:21. She requested that the full commission reconvene for committee meetings at 1:30 p.m. after lunch

(Lunch Break)

8. English Language Arts/English Language Development Subject Matter Committee

(NOTE: change in agenda order)

Present: Patrice Abarca, Chair Janet Philibosian, Vice Chair
Ken Dotson, Lora Griffin, Karen Yamamoto, Leslie Schwarze, Mary Coronado
Calvario

Staff: Deborah Keys, Consultant, CFIR

A. IMAP/CRP Applications

Chair Abarca called the meeting to order at 1:30 p.m. She thanked the Science Subject Matter Committee for allowing the switch in the agenda. Chair Abarca stated that the ELA/ELD pre-meeting scheduled for November 27, 2000 was cancelled because of a request by the Commission Chair. Chair Abarca suggested another meeting be scheduled; however, she suggested it not be in the form of a conference call. Sherry Griffith suggested spending more time at the SMC January meeting to review the applications. Chair Astore suggested that the second day of the Commission Meeting on January 18, 2001 (such as 8:00 a.m. -1:00 p.m., with a working lunch) might be a good time. This date and time was agreed upon by all SMC members. Chair Abarca stated that if the SMC did not finish the review and selection of IMAP/CRP applicants by the afternoon of Thursday, January 18, that the SMC work later in the

* *Absent for Cause* notification submitted to Commission Chair in advance of the meeting.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

same day to finish the selection in order to make recommendations to the full Commission on January 19.

Chair Abarca thanked Deborah Keys and Rick Alford for sending the binders of all applications received to this point to all SMC members. Deborah Keys stated there would be applications available for the SMC to review at the January 18 meeting; SMC members need not bring their binders of applications with them. However, Chair Abarca recommend that SMC members bring their summary sheets of the applicants to the meeting in January.

Chair Abarca acknowledged Commissioner Dotson. She commended him for his work, his humor and the comments he shared with the Commission during his term.

B. Other Matters/Audience Comments

Chair Abarca shared the preliminary survey put together by Deborah Keys which showed the potential of 34 publishers, 63 submissions for participation in the 2002 adoption. The meeting was adjourned at 1:42 p.m. after this brief discussion.

4. Visual and Performing Arts Subject Matter Committee

Present: Roy Anthony, Chair; Karen Yamamoto, Vice Chair
Mary Coronado, Lora Griffin

Absent: Janet Philibosian *, Sue Stickel *

Staff: Judi Brown, Consultant, CFIR

A. Draft VPA Standards; Field Review, Public Hearings (Update/Action)

Chair Anthony called the VPA Subject Matter Committee meeting to order at 1:40 p.m. He reported his participation in the field review hearings on the VPA standards (available at <http://www.cde.ca.gov/shsd/arts/status.html>). Chair Anthony invited Patty Taylor, Visual and Performing Arts Consultant, Standards and High School Div., CDE, to provide an update on the standards. Ms. Taylor gave a brief timeline about the development of the standards and the recent field review of the standards in relation to SB 1390 (Murray) that calls for the establishment of voluntary VPA standards by the State Board of Education. She provided detailed examples of how the standards were built upon the current VPA framework and adoption criteria, so that publishers can be confident that materials developed for the follow-up adoption based on the current framework will be comparable to the proposed voluntary standards. She discussed the strands of the standards and the grade-by grade sequencing of the standards. Examples were given of how the standards tie in with standards in the four core subject areas. Chair Anthony discussed the need to strengthen the awareness of multiple ways to incorporate visual and performing arts learning into all subject areas and all grade levels. The discussion with the Commissioners included issues about determining performance levels for those standards, access to professional development opportunities available to build teacher understanding of the arts standards, use of standards by artists brought into schools supported by the California Arts Council, the models of district/school efforts within the California Arts Assessment Network, and discussion of model efforts to build arts education within the limited school day in California. Commissioner Griffin raised the concern of the State Board presented earlier by the Interim Executive Direction: that the "... VPA standards, while rigorous and

* *Absent for Cause* notification submitted to Commission Chair in advance of the meeting.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

reflecting high expectations, are nonetheless seen as reasonable and attainable by all students at every level.”

Commissioner’ Yamamoto and Coronado raised concerns regarding the challenges faced by elementary teachers who must teach core subject standards and then possibly meet VPA standards as well.

Chair Anthony asked for a motion to voice to the State Board a statement of support for the VPA standards as voluntary. Commissioner Griffin so moved and Chair Anthony seconded it. After further discussion including concerns for the limited length of the school day, the voice vote was two “yes” (Anthony and Griffin) and two “no” (Coronado and Coronado).

B. Follow-up Adoption Timeline (Discussion). Chair Anthony indicated this item will be postponed to January 2001.

C. Special Presentation: Olympics 2000 Opening Ceremony

Roy Anthony, Commissioner, served as the director of student bands during the opening ceremonies in Australia. He presented video footage from a Canadian broadcast and anecdotes about the experience with the young musicians from around the world (including approximately 800 from California). His special presentation resulted in a standing ovation from the Commissioners and the audience.

D. Other Matters/Audience Comment. No other matters were brought forward. The committee was adjourned at 2:52 p.m.

5. Health Subject Matter Committee (SMC)

Present: Veronica Norris, Chair; Lora Griffin, Vice Chair
Roy Anthony, Richard Schwartz

Staff: Tom Adams, Administrator, Curriculum Frameworks, CDE
Caroline Roberts, Administrator, School Health Connections
Jeri Day, Consultant, School Health Connections

A. Health Framework Addendum Draft– Review Revisions and New Materials

Commissioner Veronica Norris, Chair, convened the Health Subject Matter Committee at 3:00 p.m. Chair Norris led the committee through the proposed addenda for the Health Framework. Committee members asked for corrections and specifications to be included in the addenda. After the review of the seventeen addenda, Chair Norris asked the committee to consider them for field review. Commissioner Griffin moved to forward the seventeen addenda for field review and Commissioner Anthony seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously. Chair Norris and Commissioner Griffin extended her thanks to the staff for their work. Tom Adams noted that the staff of the School Health Connections Office had done the bulk of the work, and Caroline Roberts, Administrator, stated that Jeri Day had done the majority of it.

B. Special Presentations (Information)

The Committee heard two presentations. Chair Norris recognized Nancy Dodson, Sacramento County Office of Education. Ms. Dodson spoke on Assessment Development in health and

* *Absent for Cause* notification submitted to Commission Chair in advance of the meeting.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

reported on the findings of the SEARCH Institute. She noted on the change to a positively focused curriculum. Chair Norris then recognized Greg Wolfe, Consultant, Healthy Kids Program Office. Mr. Wolfe spoke about *Getting Results, Update 1, Positive Youth Development*.

C. Other Matters/Audience Comment. Chair Norris asked if there were any comments from the Commission and the public. Hearing none, she adjourned the meeting at 3:30 p.m.

6. History-Social Science (H-SS) Subject Matter Committee

Present: Ken Dotson, Chair; Roy Anthony, Vice Chair
Rakesh Bhandari, Janet Philibosian; Barbara Smith, Karen Yamamoto
Staff: Tom Adams, Consultant, CFIR

A. Updated History-Social Science Framework (Update)

Chair Dotson called the meeting to order at 3:30 p.m. He informed fellow committee members that staff had posted the preprint version on the web and every commissioner was sent a copy. He noted that the final version will be professional proofread, include acknowledgements and contain a preface by State Board President Lozano and Superintendent Eastin.

Chair Dotson asked staff for a report on further activities. Tom Adams, Administrator for the Curriculum Frameworks Office, stated that every commissioner would be supplied with a Power Point presentation on the framework. He reported that the framework was released at the National Council for History Education conference in Sacramento in October. He stated that the framework was well received by the conference attendees. He noted that Framework roll out sessions would occur this spring.

A. Timeline for History-Social Science Follow-Up Adoption (Discussion/Action)

Chair Dotson noted that the timeline will be amended according to directions from the Executive Committee and that staff will be returning with revisions in January.

B. Other Matters/Audience Comment

Chair Dotson asked for any additional comments. Committee members and staff remarked that Chair Dotson's tenure was a most enjoyable and productive one. Commission Chair Astore congratulated Chair Dotson on overseeing the updating of the history-social science framework. The meeting was adjourned at 3:41 p.m.

7. Science Subject Matter Committee (SMC) (NOTE agenda order changed)

Present: Richard Schwartz, SMC Chair; Catherine Banker, SMC Vice-Chair; Ken Dotson, Veronica Norris, and Barbara Smith
Absent: Vik Hovsepian*
Staff: Tom Adams, Administrator

A. Field Review-Draft Science Framework (Update)

Chair Schwartz called the meeting to order at 3:41 p.m. The first item was updating the committee on the Field Review draft. He noted that the document is in its final stages of preparation and thanked Rollie Otto for his efforts. He noted that although the draft was

* *Absent for Cause* notification submitted to Commission Chair in advance of the meeting.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

approved at the last meeting, preparing the final version for field review took more time than originally thought. Nonetheless, the field review draft will be in excellent shape and as close to a final product as possible. He further noted that delays in field getting the draft ready has set back the timeline and expressed the need to discuss a new period for field review.

Commissioner Norris moved to extend the field review period by two months, and Commissioner Dotson seconded the motion. The motion passed. Chair Schwartz directed staff to present a new timetable for completion at the next meeting of the Commission.

B. Science follow-up Adoption Timeline (Discussion/Action). Because of the concerns of the Executive Committee, discussion was delayed until January.

C. Other Matters/Audience Comment. Chair Schwartz asked if any other matters needed to be addressed and for audience comment. Hearing none, he adjourned the meeting at 3:50 p.m.

Full Commission (Reconvened 3:50 p.m.)

Chair Astore reminded the Commissioners and the audience of the public gathering at a local restaurant at 7:30 a.m. for an informal, no-host breakfast to honor the departing Commissioners Smith and Dotson. The Commission was recessed at 4:00 p.m. until 9:00 a.m. on November 29.

8. FULL COMMISSION –Reconvenes Wednesday, November 29, 2000

Curriculum Commissioners--Present:

Marilyn Astore, Chair

Roy Anthony

Rakesh Bhandari

Ken Dotson

Veronica Norris

Richard Schwartz

Barbara Smith

Karen Yamamoto

Patrice Abarca, Vice Chair

Catherine Banker

Mary Coronado Calvario

Lora Griffin

Janet Philiposian

Leslie Schwarze

Susan Stickel

Commissioners--Absent:

Viken Hovsepian *

Dede Alpert, Member of the Senate

Jack Scott, Member of the Assembly

State Board of Education Liaisons:

Nancy Ichinaga (absent)

Marion Joseph (present)

California Department of Education Staff Present to Support Commission:

Sherry Skelly Griffith, Executive Secretary for the Curriculum Commission, and Director,

Curriculum Frameworks and Instructional Resources Division (CFIR)

Thomas Adams, Administrator I, Curriculum Frameworks Unit, CFIR Division

Suzanne Rios, Administrator I, Instructional Resources Unit, CFIR Division

* *Absent for Cause* notification submitted to Commission Chair in advance of the meeting.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

Sandi Adams-Jones, Staff Service Manager I, CFIR Division

Judith Brown, Consultant, CFIR

Barbara Jeffus, Consultant, CFIR

Rick Alford, Analyst

Deborah Keys, Consultant, CFIR

Olga Uribe, Consultant, CFIR

Terri Yan, Exec. Secretary, CFIR

A. Call to Order; Special Presentations.

Honor Commissioner Smith and Commissioner Dotson. Commissioner Chair Astore reconvened the Commission at 9:04 a.m. and thanked the Commissioners and public for their involvement in the informal, no-host breakfast earlier in the morning to honor retiring commissioners. Chair Astore presented a certificate of commendation signed by Governor Davis to Commissioner Dotson and Commissioner Smith. State Board Member Joseph also stated her thanks to each retiring commissioner and presented certificates of honor.

Honor Commissioner Stickel, Chair of Mathematics Subject Matter Committee. Chair Astore presented Chair Stickel awards for her leadership of the Mathematics 2001 adoption process. Chair Astore applauded her professionalism throughout this process and reflected on the compliments so many panelists and publishers had shared about her professionalism and support to each one during the process.

11. Electronic Learning Resources (ELR) Committee (*Note: agenda order changed*)

Present: Catherine Banker, Chair; Patrice Abarca, Vice Chair; Rakesh Bhandari, Mary Coronado

Absent: Vik Hovsepian*

Staff: Judith Brown, Consultant, CFIR

A. Commission on Technology in Learning (Information/Action)

see: <http://www.cde.ca.gov/edtech>). Commissioner Banker called the ELR committee to order at 9:10 a.m. and thanked the commission for allowing this committee to meet prior to the public hearing for mathematics. Commissioner Banker introduced Nancy Sullivan, administrator of the Educational Technology office, and Dr. Richard Navarro, the leader for the Technology in Learning Commission. Chair Banker gave a background on the Advisory Commission for Technology and Learning, to which Ms. Banker was appointed as a non-voting member by the Curriculum Commission. Dr. Navarro reviewed the key components of the planning guide for technology for school and district use.

After discussion with the ELR committee, Chair Banker asked for a motion for the committee to provide informal support for the technology planning guide as it goes forward to the State board of Education. Commissioner Abarca made the motion and Commissioner Coronado seconded it. The motion passed unanimously.

D. Evaluation of Electronic Learning Resources – California Learning Resources Network (CLRN; Update/Action; see <http://www.clrn.org/materials> to review CLRN draft criteria and application for CLRN Reviewers).

Chair Banker introduced Ms. Bridget Foster, Director of CLRN (Stanislaus COE) and asked for an update on the training planned for the CLRN reviewers in January and February of 2001.

Ms. Foster reviewed the training plan information and the three segments of the training as well

* *Absent for Cause* notification submitted to Commission Chair in advance of the meeting.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

as the components of the review manual. The CLRN Web site has all information about the trainings. Concerns were raised about the extent to which all reviewers would be well versed in the appropriate subject area standards and frameworks. Chair Astore asked that there be explicit training on the Frameworks as part of the reviewer training. She raised concerns that some publishers may not understand the materials must provide the instructional context needed to develop student learning of the standard(s), as described in the frameworks.

Other issues raised included concern that adequate research be reviewed regarding the impact on students and academic achievement caused by the increase in electronic learning tools. Dr. Rakesh asked for a careful look during the review for loss of skills normally taught and practiced on paper when taught/tutored on computer. Commissioner Dotson raised questions about the research base that supports the assumption that more technology will result in academic advances and other improvements in students learning. Ms. Sullivan and Ms. Foster indicated greater information in these might be shared in the future.

D. Other Matters/Audience Comment. State Board Member Joseph commended the work of the ELR committee in cooperation with the staffs of the Education Technology office and the CFIR office for the outstanding work with the CLRN Project director and Advisory Body. Chair Banker thanked staff for support in the work of the ELR committee. The ELR committee was adjourned at 9:40 a.m.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

10. Mathematics Subject Matter Committee (Approximate Time: 9:00-11:30 a.m.)

Present: Sue Stickel, Chair; Catherine Banker, Veronica Norris, Richard Schwartz,
Leslie Schwarze, Barbara Smith

Absent: Vik Hovsepien, Vice Chair*

Staff: Suzanne Rios, Administrator, Instructional Resources Unit, CFIR Division
Tom Lester, Consultant, CDE

Committee Chair Stickel convened the Mathematics subject Matter committee at 9:44 a.m.

A. Mathematics 2001 Adoption Update-Deliberations and Edits Meeting
(Information/Discussion)

B. IMAP and CRP Reports (Discussion)

C. Public Hearing on 2001 Mathematics Adoption (Approximate Time 9:30-10:30 a.m.)

D. Commissioner/Facilitator Reports on Recommendations

E. Action on Recommendations (Action)

F. Other Matters/Audience Comment

At the November 28-29, 2000, meeting of the Mathematics Subject Matter Committee meeting the committee discussed and took action on a recommended list to the state Board on the 2001 Mathematics adoption. Chair Sue Stickel led the committee in a discussion the following items: update on the 2001 Mathematics Adoption; discussion of the CRP and IMAP findings and recommendations; conducted a public hearing on the submitted programs; invited the commissioners/facilitators to summarize the findings of the IMAP reports on the 23 submitted programs; voted on the individual programs and made recommendations to the full Curriculum Commission; and provided an opportunity for public comment.

Item A. Update on the Mathematics 2001 Adoption----Deliberations, Edit Meeting

Chair Stickel provided the committee with an overview of the highlights of the Mathematics CRP meeting held October 6-7; the Mathematics Deliberations held October 15-20; and the Edits meeting held with publishers on November 9, 2000. A summary of the Edits meeting was provided to all of the commissioners in their action folders. Chair Stickel thanked all of the Commissioners who assisted in facilitating panels and, also, Patricia Duckhorn, a administrator from the Sacramento County Office of Education, who facilitator one of the panels.

Item B. IMAP and CRP Reports

Chair Stickel reminded the committee that a full set of the IMAP and CRP reports was overnighted to all Commissioners in a binder on November 6, 2000. Some of the IMAP and CRP reports were marked "draft", but, indeed, they were the final reports signed off on by the either the respective CRP or IMAP members. In preparation for the oral reports to be given by the Commissioners/Facilitators (which was covered in Item C), CFIR staff prepared a summary and highlights from the IMAP reports and put them into larger type for the Commissioners.

* *Absent for Cause* notification submitted to Commission Chair in advance of the meeting.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

Item C. Public Hearing on the Mathematics 2001 Instructional Resources Submitted for Adoption Consideration (time approximate (9:30 A.M.). The list of the speakers are below.

Following Commission practice, speakers were allowed two minutes to testify and if a publisher and/or organization had more than one speaker they were requested not to be redundant in their comments. Also, a speaker could request to relinquish their time to another colleague. Chair Stickel had a list of speakers who signed up to testify, and asked if any other members of the audience desired to be added. Speakers were assigned to speak in the order they signed up, asked to identify their name and the organization that they represented.

- Saxon Publishing Company: Barbara Murray, Fred Schilling, Lynda Dasmann, Frank Wong
- Howard M. Chase, Principal, Riviera Elementary School
- Rob Hudson, Allensworth Elementary
- Stuart Clark and Linda Van Doren, Schweitzer Elementary School
- Christine Anderson, Principal, Sierra Oak Elementary
- Larry Gipson, Randy Harmon, John Takagi, Jorge Torres, Escondido Charter High School
- Mrs. Pat Matson, San Pasqual Union School District
- Dennis Synder, Teacher
- Jim Milgram, Stanford University
- McGraw-Hill: Roger Rogalin, Jacquie Salvatore, Jan Malin, Ralph Cohen, Laura Dunn , Gunnar Carlson, Missy Kozacik
- Everyday Learning, University of Chicago: Janet Meyers, John Atkocaitis, Ann Lewis
- McDougal Littell: Doug Van Wassenhove, Denise McDowell, Linda DuBois
- CSL: Christine Losq, Mary Fraser, Debbie Barney, Ken Matsuoka
- Paul Clopton, UCSD
- JRL Enterprises: Cathy Lanier
- Howard M. Chase, Principal, Riviera Elementary
- McGraw-Hill : Roger Rogalin, Ralph Cohen, Gunnar Carlson, Missy Kozacik
- CSL: Christine Losq

Item D. Commissioners/Facilitators Reports

Chair Stickel then invited the individual commissioners and Ms. Duckhorn who facilitated 2001 Mathematics adoption panels to summarize the findings of the IMAP reports on the following panels and submitted programs.

Panel 1: Patty Abarca----Everyday Learning K-3, Harcourt Brace K-6, and Sadlier K-6

Panel 2: Veronica Norris----CSL K-7, Scott Foresman K-6, and Everyday Learning 4-6

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

Panel 3: Pat Duckhorn----Wasatch K-8 and Houghton-Mifflin K-5

Panel 4: Barbara Smith----McGraw Hill K-6, Saxon K-3, and Saxon 3-6

Panel 5: Catherine Banker----Everyday Learning 7, Carnegie Learning 8,
Prentice-Hall (Pre-Algebra) 7

Panel 6: Richard Schwartz----McDougal (Concepts and Skills) 6-8, Prentice
Hall (Algebra) 8, and Riverdeep 6-8

Panel 7: Leslie Schwarze----McDougal (Structure and Method) 6-8, Everyday
Learning 8, and Holt 8

Panel 8: Lora Griffin----Saxon 7-8, and JRL 6 and 8

Item E. Action on Recommendations

Chair Stickel then reviewed with the Subject Matter Committee Members the instructions that the Commission uses for entertaining resolutions. She reiterated the following: 1) neither the committee nor Commission would entertain negative resolutions; 2 if, a program were not recommended, the resolution still needed to be stated in a positive manner (to recommend) and then the resolution failed to win a second or the necessary votes.

At the Subject Matter Committee level a motion would be made to forward a recommendation for a program on to the full Commission. With programs not recommended at the committee level, a motion would be made and it would fail to receive a second. However, if a program did not receive a recommendation from the Subject Matter Committee, the Full Commission could take it up.

Chair Stickel went on to explain that at the Full Commission session, programs recommended by the SMC are voted on by a roll call vote of the Commission. Programs that failed to get a recommendation in the SMC, need to be voted on by the full Commission. These programs needed a motion and a second in order for the Commission to vote on a program. Attached is a chart reflected the SMC votes and the Full Commission votes on the submitted programs (see Attachment B)

Discussion by commissioners opened to full Commission; voice vote by SMC.

Boxed lunch break

Full Commission Vote 1:28 p.m.-2:10 p.m. (see chart below)

Other business related to math 2:15 p.m.-2:45 p.m.

Math completed all business at 2:45 p.m.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

Full Commission Action on Recommendations - 2001 Mathematics Adoption: Following is a summary of the voice votes by the Curriculum Commission on motions made “. . . to recommend [each publisher], [each program] for [grade/grade span] for adoption to the State Board of Education. (Each motion was made by Mathematics SMC Chair, Sue Stickle, and seconded by Leslie Schwarze or Veronica Norris.)

Publisher: Program Title	Grade(s)	Final Recommendation to SBE:	Vote Yes	Vote No	Absent	Abstain
Carnegie: Cognitive Tutor, Algebra 1	8	NO	0	15	1	0
CSL Associates: Success with Mathcoach	K-5	YES	14	0	1	0
Everyday Learning: Everyday Mathematics, 2 nd Ed.	K-3	NO	6	9	1	0
Everyday Learning: Everyday Mathematics	4-6	NO	1	14	1	0
Everyday Learning: Course 2 Impact Mathematics	7	NO	0	15	1	0
Everyday Learning: Course 3 Impact Mathematics	8	NO	0	15	1	0
Harcourt School Publishers: Harcourt Math @ 2002 [w/ Spanish as Alternate Format K-6]	K-6	YES	15	0	1	0
Holt Rinehart: Algebra 1, CA Ed.	8	NO	0	15	1	0
Houghton Mifflin Company: Mathematics by Houghton Mifflin [w/Spanish as Alternate Format K-5] *(See note below)	K-5	YES	15	0	1	0
JRL: I Can Learn Mathematics	6	NO	0	15	1	0
JRL: I Can Learn Algebra	8	NO	0	15	1	0
McDougal Littell Inc.: Concepts and Skills	6-8	YES	14	0	1	1
McDougal Littell Inc.: Structure and Method	6-8	YES	15	0	1	0
McGraw-Hill School Division: McGraw-Hill Mathematics [w/ Spanish as Alternate Format K-6]	K-6	YES	11	4	1	0
Prentice Hall, Inc.: Prentice Hall Pre-Algebra, CA Ed.	7	YES	15	0	1	0
Prentice Hall, Inc.: Prentice Hall Algebra 1, CA Ed.	8	YES	15	0	1	0
Riverdeep, Inc.: Destination Math	7	NO	0	15	1	0
Sadlier, William H., Inc.: Progress in Mathematics CA Ed.	K-6	YES	15	0	1	0
Saxon Publishers, Inc.: Saxon Math K-3, An Incremental Development [w/ Spanish as Alternate Format]	K-3	YES	13	2	1	0

* *Absent for Cause* notification submitted to Commission Chair in advance of the meeting.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

Publisher: Program Title	Grade(s)	Final Recommendation to SBE:	Vote Yes	Vote No	Absent	Abstain
Saxon Publishers, Inc.: Math 54, 65, 76, and 87	3-6	YES	11	4	1	0
Saxon Publishers, Inc.: Algebra ½ and Algebra 1	7-8	NO	2	12	1	0
Scott Foresman: Scott Foresman CA Mathematics [w/ Spanish as Alternate Format K-6]	K-6	YES	14	0	1	1
Wasatch Interactive Learning: Math Expeditions	K-5	NO	0	15	1	0

* NOTE: Houghton Mifflin submitted a letter on September 28, 2000 withdrawing their spanish program. The Curriculum Commission was not aware of this withdrawal at the time of their actions on the recommendations.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

12. Foreign Language Subject Matter Committee

Present: Leslie Schwarze, Chair, Mary Coronado, Vice Chair

Patrice Abarca, Rakesh Bhandari, Sue Stickel

Staff: Tom Adams, Administrator, Curriculum Frameworks, CFIR

Arleen Burns, Consultant, Professional Development Division, CDE

A. SMC Meeting October 15, 2000

Chair Schwarze called the meeting to order at 2:46 p.m. The first item of business was approval of the minutes from the meeting on October 15, 2000. Commissioner Calvario moved to approve the minutes and Commissioner Stickel seconded the motion. The motion passed.

A. Framework Revision

Chair Schwarze then had Committee members present their comments on Chapter 3: Content of the Foreign Language. Commission Chair Astore and Commissioner Calvario put forth suggestions for improving the chapter and these were accepted by the Committee. The Committee then expressed its appreciation for the staff's effort in writing Chapter 3. Tom Adams noted that Arleen Burns deserves full credit. It was noted that the next two chapters would be on Implementation and Assessment. Commissioner Calvario expressed interest in the Implementation chapter and volunteered to be the lead on this chapter. The Committee then decided to meet on December 21 to discuss the next two chapters.

B. Other Matters/Audience Comment

Chair Schwarze ask for other commissioner comments and audience comment. Hearing none, she adjourned the meeting at 3:30 p.m.

10. Full Curriculum Commission (Reconvened, Afternoon, November 29, 2000)

Chair Astore reconvened the full commission at 3:30 p.m. and requested each committee report actions needing the attention of the full commission.

A. Reports/Actions from Subcommittees

Executive Committee.

- Action: Chair Astore reported that Executive Committee agreed to recommend to the full commission that the election of officers take place at the January meeting henceforth. Commissioner Abarca seconded the motion. The motion passed by voice vote.
- Request: Chair Astore reported that the Executive Committee gave staff direction to adjust the draft timeline for the three 2002 follow-up adoptions to reflect a mid-July deliberations, action by the Commission in September and November action by the State Board. The timeline is to be returned for Executive Committee review in January prior to discussions by each subject matter committee involved (science, history-social science, visual and performing arts).
- Request. Chair Astore reported that the Executive Committee gave staff direction to plan the January orientation for January 17, approximately 9:00-2:30 p.m., with plans for the full commission to meet from 3-5 p.m. for elections.

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

English Language Arts/English Language Development Subject Matter Committee. Chair Abarca reported no action.

Visual and Performing Arts Subject Matter Committee. Chair Anthony indicated there was no formal action to report.

Health Subject Matter Committee. Committee Chair Norris moved that the committee had agreed to forward all seventeen addenda to the Health Framework for field review. The motion passed by voice vote.

History-Social Science Subject Matter Committee. Commission Dotson indicated there was no formal action to report.

Electronic Learning Resources Committee. Vice Chair Abarca reported that the ELR committee had given informal approval to the planning guide for technology that is being forwarded to the State Board. She reported that concerns were raised for staff consideration regarding the training of reviewers for the CLRN review process for electronic learning resources. No formal action was reported.

Mathematics Subject Matter Committee. Commissioner Stickel referred to the results of the final vote of the full commission on the mathematics recommendations to the State Board of Education.

- Action. Chair Stickel moved to recommend that Commissioner Mary Coronado be appointed to the Legal and Social Compliance panel to meet in December. The motion passed unanimously.
- Action: Chair Stickel moved to recommend that the State Board take action in December to direct publishers with assessment changes to make the changes a condition of adoption. The motion passed unanimously.
- Action. Chair Stickel recommended to the full commission to appoint a writing committee to complete a Commission draft of the Mathematics adoption report. The motion passed unanimously.
- Action. Chair Stickel recommended that the Commission adopt language the language found in Title 5 Regulations to prohibit publishers from withdrawing a submission for adoption within seven days of deliberations. The motion passed unanimously.

Foreign Language Subject Matter Committee. Commissioner Schwarze, Chair, reported that the committee approved the minutes from the previous SMC meeting held prior to the start of the Mathematics Deliberations and that the committee requested a special SMC conference call meeting on December 21 to review the next piece of the framework under development.

Science Subject Matter Committee. Science Chair, Commissioner Schwartz, reported that the Science SMC gave direction for staff to proceed with the on-line field review of the draft

Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission

An Advisory Body to the California State Board of Education

Final MINUTES OF MEETING: November 28-29, 2000

(Approved with corrections January 17-19, 2001)

framework (<http://www.cde.ca.gov/cilbranch/cc>). He then made a motion for the field review of the draft framework would be adjusted from December to January. The motion passed by voice vote.

B. Reports from Commission Liaisons.

CSMP. Judi Brown reported to Chair Astore that Eleanor Brown, the Commission liaison to the University of California Concurrence Committee of California Subject Matter Projects (CSMP), is interested in presenting to the Commission a full report of her year of work as the Commission representative to the Concurrence Committee. Chair Astore asked the Commissioners for their approval for time on the agenda for a report; she then directed staff to arrange for a presentation by former Commission Chair Brown. Staff recommended the materials submitted by Dr. Brown and found within the "Reading" section of the November agenda packet need to be retained for the January meeting. Board Member Joseph voiced strong compliments about former Commissioner Brown's work and praised the Commission's practice of assigning the Commission Chair of the prior year to that liaison position for each following next year.

California Commission for Teacher Credentialing (CTC). Commissioner Schwarze raised ongoing concern for coherence with the policies adopted by the State Board of Education.

C. Individual Commissioner Reports.

Commissioner Schwartz reported he continues to be involved with the Science Subject Matter Project advisory body. Commissioner Yamamoto reported she has been involved on the leadership team of the Writing Project out of UC Davis.

D. Other Matters/Audience Comment.

Chair Astore thanked the Commissioners for their attendance and determination to participate through the entire meeting. Chair Astore and others praised Commissioner Dotson again for his leadership in the development of the framework for history-social science and in his contributions to major efforts of the Commission during his tenure. No further comments were offered from the audience. The meeting was adjourned at 4:00 p.m., November 29, 2000.

For further information about these minutes, please contact the Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission (CDSMC) at 916-654-3361 or the Curriculum Frameworks and Instructional Resources (CFIR) Division, California Department of Education, 721 Capitol Mall, Sixth Floor, Sacramento, CA, 95814; telephone 916-657-3023; fax 657-5437.

Use the following Web site to access up-to-date information about the work of the Curriculum Development and Supplemental Materials Commission and the office of the Curriculum Frameworks and Instructional Resources Division: <http://www.cde.ca.gov/cilbranch/cc>.

Respectfully submitted December 15, 2000: Judith L. Brown, Consultant and Staff Liaison to the Curriculum Commission, Curriculum Frameworks and Instructional Resources Division; phone 916-657-5447; fax 916-657-5437; e-mail jbrown@cde.ca.gov. Draft Ver 3/20/01